

Reviews

adolescent slower learners and their teachers.

Roy Bentley

University of British Columbia

**Leon Burton &
William Thomson, eds.
THE COMPREHENSIVE
MUSICIANSHIP PROGRAM.
Don Mills:
Addison-Wesley, 1973-1974.
11 parts.
Teachers' books, \$8.50.
Students' books, \$3.25 - \$8.00.**

The Comprehensive Musicianship Program for grades K-12 developed at the University of Hawaii is a product of seven years' work by sixteen specialists in Music and Education. Some of its features include lessons organized around behavioral objectives; a discovery approach of learning, placing the emphasis on the reception of the student rather than the delivery of the instructor; and a spiral curriculum based on seven concepts of music: texture, tone, rhythm, melody, harmony, tonality, and form.

The program has been divided into five zones, roughly corresponding to the traditional K-12 divisions:

- Zone 1 — kindergarten,
grade 1
- Zone 2 — grades 2 and 3
- Zone 3 — grades 4, 5, and 6
- Zone 4 — junior high school
- Zone 5 — high school, college

The goal of the approach is that through interaction with the seven musical concepts the students will ultimately compose, improvise, perform, discuss, and respond. In short, the object of this program is to foster independent interest, values, and commitment through the development of comprehensive musicianship.

Much can be said in favor of zones 1, 2, and 3: the presentation is clear and concise, the table of contents is made up of detailed scope and sequence charts, and the children are actively involved in clapping, playing instruments, improvising, conducting, compos-

ing, performing, analyzing (visually and aurally), experimenting, reading, and accompanying. However, the books contain no poetry, no color of any kind, no seasonal songs, and no related arts or other materials; and the workbook format of the student books throughout the series may not appeal to present-day children.

The band, choral, and orchestra books are divided into units, each unit having as its core a study of a composition for that particular area. Each unit contains student objectives stated in behavioral terms, activities for developing comprehensive musicianship, and evaluation guides for assessing student musical growth as in the first three zones. Each book contains appendices which provide fundamentals, bibliography, discography and, in some cases, information on conducting, instrument care, and string instrument techniques.

Because the curriculum is sequentially planned so that primary understandings are revisited, expanded and reinforced, we contend that it would be necessary for students to have previous background in a program of this type prior to beginning zones 4 and 5 of the series. Many band, choral, and orchestral students at the secondary level lack sufficient preparation for improvising, composing, transcribing, and arranging music. The chance of students' achieving success at these skills without a considerable amount of background and practice is highly questionable.

This comprehensive approach demands a high proportion of the already limited amount of rehearsal time generally allotted to musical performing organizations. The program also suggests unrealistically that time be provided for both large and small ensembles.

The final book in zone 5, *Introduction to Music as Structure*, seems to have been included as an afterthought although it was one of the first of the publications of the series to become available. Advertised for grades 9-14, it is designed for students to gain a

better understanding of music and to develop a more sensitive response to musical works through playing, composing, and listening. This book should be attempted only at the college level and only if the student has been thoroughly versed in the comprehensive musicianship approach.

There will be follow-up books in the series as more research is done, and it will be interesting to see these as they become available. Personally, we would like to see the musical growth and development of a class that has been fortunate enough to go through the entire program. However, because this program employs a spiral approach and because in Quebec little time is allowed for music in elementary grades and there are few music specialists, it would be of use in this Province only as supplementary material providing music educators with many new ideas that are not part of any series currently in our schools.

Roger Cook
Elaine McDonald
Lorraine Thibeault
McGill University

**T. Morrison and A. Burton, eds.
OPTIONS: REFORMS AND
ALTERNATIVES FOR
CANADIAN EDUCATION.**

Toronto:

Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1973.
425 pp. \$7.25.

There is a long and honorable tradition of Foundations supporting conferences which have had excellent, publishable results. There have been some notable attempts of book publishers to arrange, or support, similar meetings with publication seen as a more distant result. The present financial support of a publishing house for two mid-west educators to travel across Canada, marked a great step forward. The pity is that they did not receive their due reward in publishable material.

As the editors note in their introduction, surprisingly few books

have been written about education in Canada. Editors of books have little chance to exchange ideas at first hand; a great deal of atomized and sectarian activity inevitably results. The editors broke with tradition, too, for although some of the articles are reprinted from other sources, the majority were written specifically for this book; the contributors, during (or after) one confused and invigorating discussion in Montreal (where all discussions are confused or invigorating, or both) were invited to participate in shaping the book. As a result we have a confused, pedestrian book full of sociological clichés, little related to Canada, its options or reforms. There are few good papers, several competent ones that say nothing new, and the better ones have been published before. It is true that the two longest papers in the book deal with Canada and reform; these are the papers by Henchey, previously published in this *Journal*, and Lyson, both dealing entirely with the Quebec scene. There is nothing comparable for any other province. Even those directed to, say, Manitoba do little more than donate a couple of sentences to provincial affairs. Some on Toronto (as representative of Ontario?) may give a few paragraphs, seldom more.

As we would expect there are competent papers from Katz, and Crittenden, but not in a real Canadian context, and from Illich and Reimer which are even more remote from the Canadian scene. There is Canadian content from Tomkins, in a paper also published elsewhere, which begins in a documented, scholarly-historical fashion to examine the possible bases of Canadian nationalism. After beginning to look possibly controversial it veers away and ends by becoming a current-status report of the Canada-Studies Foundation. For my money, the article by Carney, a historian, is the most entertaining, stimulating, voluble contribution, written with exuberance out of much popular, topical reading. It would be most interesting to determine whether the ideas