

of survey or synthesis of Québec education, but instead, he is presented with a series of specialized essays. These articles have appeared already in other publications and from this point of view Lajeunesse brings nothing new to the reader, but nevertheless, he does gather under one cover six articles arranged chronologically to present fundamental issues in the development of Québec education: Fernand Ouellet, "L'enseignement primaire: responsabilité des Eglises ou de l'Etat? (1801-1836)"; Marcel Lajeunesse, "L'évêque Bourget et l'Instruction publique au Bas-Canada, (1840-1846)"; André Labarrère-Paulé, "L'instituteur laïque canadien-français au 19ème siècle"; Louis-Philippe Audet, "Le projet de Ministère de l'Instruction publique en 1897"; Louis-Philippe Audet, "La querelle de l'Instruction obligatoire: (1875-1943)"; Léon Dion, "Le Bill 60 et la société québécoise".

It is easy to second guess a collection of this kind and to suggest that the editor should have selected other articles and topics instead of or in addition to those presented. This line of criticism is not particularly fruitful. It is far more important to determine whether the selection made does represent some of the major trends in Québec education in the 19th and 20th centuries. Lajeunesse has indeed made a representative selection of some very basic themes. The dominant theme is that of the constant interaction between church and state over the control of education: the clash between church and state in the early 19th century over the first education acts; the beginning of the hegemony of the church in education under Bishop Bourget in the mid-19th century; the virtual elimination of the influence of lay teachers in education by the end of the 19th century; the defeat by the church of the attempts of the state to re-affirm its authority in education by proposing the re-establishment of a Ministry of Education in 1897; the long struggle over compulsory education in which the church

played a negative role; finally, with Bill 60, the beginning of the state's assertion of its place in education in a quietly revolutionized society.

It is unfortunate that editorial policy did not provide for some kind of introduction and/or conclusion which could have expressed and explained the basic theme in these articles. The good selection made by Lajeunesse would have been better served had a brief commentary on church-state interaction in Quebec education been included.

The basic plan of the editors is to present brief historiographical studies with each collection of readings in this series and Lajeunesse's well documented twelve page introductory essay is excellent. He presents concisely a critical review of the literature and indicates those topics in need of further research. This kind of survey should prove helpful to students of the history of education, and if similar surveys in the other volumes are as well done, the whole collection will make a valuable contribution to Québec historiography.

Réal G. Boulianne
Vanier College

Laurence K. Shook.

**CATHOLIC
POST-SECONDARY
EDUCATION IN
ENGLISH-SPEAKING
CANADA: A HISTORY.**
Toronto:

University of Toronto Press,
1971. 457 pp. \$15.00.

Laurence K. Shook's book, eight years in preparation, is a thorough study of English-speaking Roman Catholic institutions of post-secondary education from

Reviews

their origin to 1970. The majority of the chapters are a "chronicle" (Shook's choice of words with which I agree) of schools, grouped by regions, organized from east to west across the country. With precision, almost to the point of over-regularity in arranging his material, each institution is first located geographically and then we are told of its founding, the style, cost and construction of buildings, who taught there and the curriculum. As promised in his introductory chapter, Shook points out "identifiable patterns running through them — transfer of emphasis from the providing of priests to the providing of lay leaders, separation of high school from college programmes, . . . conscious awareness of degrees, admission of women . . . acceptance of the validity of high standards, and the dedication to the pursuit of learning for its own sake and God's." (p. 31)

Most chapters are a traditional history of schools recording what, when and where. However, in many cases, Shook's book provides the first readily available record of institutional development, a service to Canadian scholars and laymen which will undoubtedly make his work a respected and valued reference. Taken collectively, Shook's chronicles contain much more than sterile accounts of one event after another. While it is not the major thrust of the book, the author's personal experiences as a church scholar enabled him to make many critical insights into the educational role of the Church. His record of its power, the catholicity of its interests and involvements in an increasingly temporal society and particularly his observations of the various personalities of churchmen who have controlled the growth and shaped the character of the Church's educational institutions represent a significant contribution to our understanding of Canadian education.

Despite these positive features, the why of educational history is often missing. For example, why

was it "to be expected" that Christ the King College in London would "lack . . . money to acquire and maintain adequate staff" (p. 296) when it began operation in 1955? Coupled with the information that there was "too little space for a college operation" one is left to wonder why King's College, as it is known now, was opened at all. When King's became co-educational in 1968 it placed Brescia, an Ursuline girls' college founded in 1919, in an embarrassing position of redundancy. According to Shook "after considerable soul-searching Brescia decided to accept the whole development of King's College as historically valid and to rely on goodwill and collaboration to redress possible injury." (p. 304) Further down on the same page the author calls a government grant system to Brescia for university-wide Home Economics students "just" but flails the government for saving the principle of no grants to denominational institutions "in the context of honest collaboration", by describing it as "somewhat ridiculous". The question why King's was allowed to make Brescia redundant goes unanswered and one is left to wonder at the import of Robin Harris' observation in his Foreword that "the welfare of Canadian higher education may well depend upon how many members of parliament and government officials read this book." (p. vi)

Also, the author's occasional excursions into the contemporary controversies of university development are sometimes unsatisfactory. The creation of the University of Prince Edward Island in 1970 is treated at some length but is marred by inaccuracies. It is incorrect to suggest that Frank MacKinnon had little respect for either St. Dunstan's or Prince of Wales College (p. 51); it is common knowledge that he had none for St. Dunstan's and considerable respect for Prince of Wales to which he devoted a great deal of himself to improve its strengths and eradicate its weaknesses. Reference to his book, *The Politics*

of *Education*, in this case is unwarranted supposition. It is correct to say that the Bonnell Commission was "wanting in courage" (p. 53) but incorrect to write that MacKinnon "looked at the report as a double victory." He had expected more from the Commission and knew that its recommendations left too much room for political manoeuvring and perpetuation of the chronic university question in which the quality of higher education available in P.E.I. might suffer irrevocable damage. Everyone did not know (p. 53) that two universities could not be afforded for a time. It depended on how scarce public funds were spent on two institutions, one public and non-denominational, the other private and sectarian. And time might have allowed for growth of understanding among all parties rather than the bitterness occasioned by the premature nuptials arranged by Premier Campbell's government which prompted MacKinnon's resignation. A balanced interpretation of the St. Dunstan's-Prince of Wales merger will not be written until we have access to some documents held in private collections and the memoirs of key participants from all factions.

Father Shook's last chapter entitled "Contemporary Directions" is undoubtedly the most important in the book. Here, the author confronts the nature of Catholic higher education and to a lesser extent the chronic questions of

who shall pay for it and whether or not it will survive if public support is not forthcoming. These serious issues are approached forthrightly in that both strengths and weaknesses are underscored. But the fundamental issue is unresolved: "The Church's only concern can be man's learning in the context of his faith and religious experience." (p. 415) Policy statements from the First Council of Canadian Bishops at Quebec in 1851 through Vatican II (1962-5) and the International Congress of Catholic Universities (Rome 1969) have not changed that fact and the contiguous one that many people do not regard it an adequate framework in which to define scholarship in post-secondary education. Whether or not such a denominational position is good enough to warrant public funds in its support must continue to be a vital but, as yet, largely unanswered question. The position of the Church, stated fairly and openly by Shook in this chapter deserves careful consideration. His own conclusion regarding the fate of Catholic colleges is decidedly ambivalent and ironically temporal. "They should probably be preserved." (p. 432) "For what they achieve, they deserve survival, which is open to as many forms as man's ingenuity can propose." (p. 433)

Hugh A. Stevenson
The University of
Western Ontario